BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06081347 4

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Aug 4-011

CLASS ACTIONS: CASES AND MATERIALS

2011

KE 1161

Garry D. Watson
Emeritus Professor
Osgoode Hall Law School
York University Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

SEP - 1 2011

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Aug 4-011

CLASS ACTIONS: CASES AND MATERIALS

2011

Garry D. Watson
Emeritus Professor
Osgoode Hall Law School
York University Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/classactionscase01wats_2

Chapter One: A BIG PICTURE OVERVIEW

Preface 3

Introduction and a Reading Guide to this Chapter 5

Part I – An Overview of Class Actions 9

COMPARATIVE CLASS ACTIONS: SOME LESSONS AND REFLECTIONS FROM STUDYING VARIOUS REGIMES 9
1. WHY HAVE CLASS ACTIONS? 26
2. HOW CLASS ACTIONS WORK 26
3. CLASS PROCEEDINGS FLOW CHART 30

Part II: Benefits of Class Actions: Judicial Economy, Access to Justice, and Behaviour Modification 32

OLRC: "MAJOR GOALS OF CLASS ACTIONS: AN EVALUATION" 32
1. Regulatory Failure and Behaviour Modification 45

Part III – Class Action Legislation 47

(A) AN OVERVIEW AND CHRONOLOGY OF CANADIAN CLASS ACTION LEGISLATION 47
1. The Ontario Legislation: What We Got Instead of the OLRC's Draft Class Actions Bill ... 51
Ontario Class Proceedings Act, 1992 S.O. 1992, c. 6. 52
2. Selected (distinctive) provisions from the B.C. Act 52
3. Quebec's legislation 53
4. Political Ideology and Class Action Legislation 57
(B) THE US RULE: FEDERAL RULE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE 23 59
(C) CERTIFICATION IN THE US 60

Part IV – Problems with the U.S (and Canadian?) Class Action Regimes: The Rand Report 62

THE RAND INSTITUTE FOR CIVIL JUSTICE --- CLASS ACTION DILEMMAS: PURSUING PUBLIC GOALS FOR PRIVATE GAIN ... 62

Part V – The Foundational Case Law on Certification (and How the Supreme Court Rewrote the CPA) 66

MAJOR CASE LAW ON CERTIFICATION 66
Hollick v. Toronto (City) 67
Rumley v. British Columbia 82
NOTES AND QUESTIONS 96
1. Garry Watson, "Note on the Supreme Court trilogy" 96
2. A Critique of *Hollick* 102
3. Binnie's "Smell Test" 103
4. The direction of certification in Canada 104

Chapter Two: Certification Requirements

Notes on Certification Requirements 107

1. General Statements of Contemporary (contested) Certification Requirements 107

Notes and Questions 114
1. Certification Requirements for "Settlement" Class Actions 114
2. Certification Rates in Ontario 114

A) Cause of Action 115

1. What the legislation says 115

2. What the courts said 115

Notes and Questions 117
1. Can there be "Industry Class Actions"? 117
2. Consumer Organizations as Plaintiffs in Quebec Class Actions (by Jacob Ziegel) 120
3. Cause of action: additional concerns 121
4. Might the Tide Turn?: Cullity J. on Cause of Action 121

(B) Identifiable Class (Class Definition) 122

1. What the legislation says 122
2. What the SCC said 122

3. The case law and discussion 123
Bywater v. Toronto Transit Commission 123

Notes and Questions 125
1. Ragoonanan and the "identifiable class" requirement 125
Ragoonanan Estate v. Imperial Tobacco Canada Ltd. 128
2. Class Definition and Res Judicata 129
3. More on Class Definition and Res Judicata 130
4. Overinclusive class definitions 131

Taub v. The Manufacturers Life Insurance Co 133

Notes and Questions 134
1. *Taub* 134
2. Is evidence of a litigious class required? 135
3. More on the requirement of the litigious class 136

(C) Common Issues 138

1. What the legislation says 138

2. What the SCC said 138

3. The case law and discussion 139
Caputo v. Imperial Tobacco Ltd. 139

Notes and Questions 144
1. Caputo: the "Common Issues" requirement 144
2. The continuing importance of finding a common issue at certification 145

Singer v. Schering-Plough Canada Inc. 145
3. Singer on the common issues requirement 146

(D) Preferable Procedure 148

1. What the legislation says 148

2. What the SCC Said 149

3. The case law and discussion 151
Historical Progression of Preferability - confusion after *Hollick,* shift in *Cloud,* reaffirmation in *Inco* and the rise of aggregate assessment 151
Cloud v. Canada (Attorney General) – Div. Court 152
Cloud v. Canada (Attorney General) – Court of Appeal 154

Notes and Questions 162
1. What does "preferable procedure" mean today? 162
2. Defendant's ADR compensation scheme as preferable procedure 162
3. Is the *Hollick* "Three Goals" preferable procedure analysis always required? 164

(E) Adequacy of Representation 164

1. What the legislation says 164

2. What the SCC Said 165

3. The case law and discussion 165
Introductory note 165
1176560 Ontario Ltd. v. The Great Atlantic & Pacific Company of Canada Ltd. 166

Notes and Questions 169
1. Some cases on adequacy of representation 169

(F) Evidence on the certification motion 171

1. What the SCC Said 171

2. Nothing in legislation? 172

Notes and Questions 172
1. Requirement of evidence on certification 172
2. The use of evidence on certification: What is the test on the motion? 176
3. Justice Cullity on "Some Basis in Fact" 178
4. U.S. Supreme Court Decision in Wal-Mart 178
5. Political leanings of the U.S. Supreme Court 179

3. Digression: Important procedural matters 180
a. Rule 20 Motions 180
b. Rule 21 Motions 182
c. Availability of Motions under Rules 20 and 21 183
d. *Res Judicata* implications 184
e. Timing/Hearing of Pre-certification Motion – Generally 184
f. Delivery of a statement of defence 185

4. Rights of Appeal 187

Notes and Questions 192
1. Comparing Rights of Appeal in Quebec, Ontario and B.C. 192
2. Routes of Appeal in Ontario and B.C. 192
3. Questions Re Routes of Appeal 193

(G) Damages – Individual versus Aggregate Assessment 193

1. The case law and discussion 193
Markson v. MBNA Canada Bank 194

Notes and Questions 201
1. What is the likely impact of Markson? 201
2. *Markson* and *Cassano*: The Courts Embrace Ss. 23, 24 and 25 -- statistical evidence, aggregate assessment and the courts' broad powers to determine the procedures to be followed for determining individual issues. 201
3. Use of Statistical Evidence for the Determination of Liability as Opposed to Damages 204
4. Why did it take so long for aggregate assessment of damages to become a solution (in some instances) to the problem of individual assessment of damages making class actions not the preferable procedure? 208
Sauer v. Canada (Attorney General) 209

NOTES 210

1. Some Recent Cases on Certification 210

2. Additional readings 210

CHAPTER THREE: SETTLEMENT OF CLASS ACTIONS AND FEES

PART 1 – SETTLEMENT 213

Introductory Note 213

An overview of the settlement process 215

(A) Some U.S. and Canadian Commentary on Settlement 221

Susan P. Koniak, The Plight Of Absent Class Members Denied Adequate Representation 221

"Opt-In" Proposal for Class Settlements 223

The law on settlement approval and fee approval 224

Notes and Questions 228

(B) Some U.S. and Canadian Settlement Approval Case Law 236

Reynolds v. Beneficial National Bank 236

Notes and Questions 247

Gariepy v. Shell Oil Co. 248

Notes and Questions 261

1. Should the court have approved this settlement? 261
2. What was the "deal" – i.e., the terms of the settlement? 261
3. Methods of Evaluating the Adequacy of a Proposed Settlement 261
4. Direct Payment of Counsel Fees By Defendant Approved in Gariepy 262
5. Coupon settlements and reversionary settlements. 262
6. Celanese denied standing to object to the Dupont settlement 263
7. Possible solutions to the "settlement problem" 263
8. Indexing Counsel Fees to the Actual Settlement Benefits Received by the Class 265
9. Where a class proceedings has been certified, are class members entitled to settle individually? 265
10. Communicating with the Class 267
11. An Overview and Critique of Cy Pres 269

Settlement and Fee Approval – Smith v. National Money Mart 275

Gilbert v. Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce **278**

Notes and Questions **284**

PART 2 FEES – REMUNERATING CLASS COUNSEL 287

Introductory Note 287

Provisions of the Ontario Class Proceedings Act Respecting Fees 288

Gagne v. Silcorp Limited 290

Directright Cartage Ltd. v. London Life Insurance Co. 292

Notes and Questions **293**

Wilson v Servier Canada Inc. 308

Notes and Questions **320**

Ben Alarie, Rethinking the Approval of Class Counsel's Fees in Ontario Class ActionsMore on Approval of Class Counsel Fees 325

A Fair and Reasonable Approach to Fees 327

Robertson v. Thomson Canada Ltd., [2009] O.J. No. 2650 ..... **328**

Smith Estate v. National Money Mart Co. **329**

Notes and Questions **330**

1. Settlement and Fee Approval – Smith v. National Money Mart 330

2. A Pocket Guide for Class Action Settlement 333

Chapter Four: RES JUDICATA + NATIONAL CLASSES AND OVERLAPPING AND PARALLEL CLASS ACTIONS

1. Introduction – Res Judicata basics 340

Introductory Note 340

Ontario Class Proceedings Act s. 27 340

Garry Watson, "Res judicata and class proceedings" (1999) 341

2. National Classes 343

Garry D. Watson, "Certification of National Classes and Their Constitutionality" 343

Notes and Questions 344

1. Two parts to the national class puzzle 344

An Overview of the Jurisprudence on National Classes 345

*Wilson v. Servier Canada Inc. et al.** 345

Notes and questions 347

1. Jurisprudence on National Classes 347
2. Competing views of National Class Action 361

Peter Hogg's Vision of National Class Actions 361

Craig Jones' take 362

3. Plaintiff Counsel Commence Tandem Actions in B.C. and Ontario 363

3. Res judicata in the inter-provincial and international context 364

Currie v. McDonald's Restaurants of Canada Ltd 364

Notes and Questions 366

Extract from "The Legal Erosion of the 49th Parallel" 366

1. International Class Actions: The Implications of the *Currie v. McDonald's Corporation* Decision366

Canada Post Corp. v. Lépine 371

2. Lepine explained 373

Notes and Questions 375

1. Ontario Stands Its Ground on the National Class: McCutcheon v. The Cash Store Inc 375
2. The Emerging Framework 377
3. Some Applications of Res Judicata in Class Actions 378
4. Stretching the Concept of Abuse of Process 379
5. Recent Trends in Class Action Notice 380
6. Qualifications to the operation of res judicata. 382
7. Dow Chemical Co. v. Stephenson, 539 U.S. 111 (2003) 382
8. Notice to class members and the need to take its adequacy seriously 383
9. Residential schools class action: A huge settlement and (almost) Canada's first experience with "inventory litigation" combined with a class action settlement 385

4. Parallel and overlapping class actions (and carriage motions) 389

Introductory Note 389

Carriage Motions 389

Vitapharm Canada Ltd. v. F. Hoffmann-La Roche Ltd. 390
Ricardo v. Air Transat A.T. Inc. 391
Setterington v. Merck Frosst Canada Ltd. 392
Sharma v. Timminco Ltd. 394

Notes and Questions 396

1. *Fantl v. Transamerica Life* 396
2. Competing National Classes – the Vioxx litigations 398
3. Agent Orange litigation 401

5. The ULCC's Report on National Class Actions 402

6. Canadian Bar Association's National Class Actions Task Force 2010 404